

Ericka J. Patillo. A content analysis of the back of the book indexes of hymnals of the Baptist, Episcopal and Methodist denominations in the United States. A Master's paper for the Master of Science in Library Science degree. June 1999. 36 pages. Advisor: Jane Greenberg.

This paper documents the content analysis of back of the book indexes of selected Methodist, Episcopal and Baptist denominational hymnals published between 1801 and 1996 and designated for use by these American congregations. The study was conducted to ascertain if any denominational and chronological trends in the indexing of these hymnals exist; if so, to determine what they are, the significance of these differences, to speculate on the reasons these differences exist and to explore the ramifications of these differences to the fields of hymnology and information science.

An important historical discovery was that metrical and alphabetical tune indexes appeared at the same time that scores began to be included in hymnals (1855). Additionally, although the three denominations share more than half the contents of their individual hymnbooks, each group favors a particular set of indexes.

Headings:

Baptists — Hymns — Indexes

Episcopal Church — Hymns — Indexes

Hymns, English — Indexes

Methodist Church — Hymns — Indexes

A CONTENT ANALYSIS OF THE BACK OF THE BOOK INDEXES OF HYMNALS
OF THE BAPTIST, EPISCOPAL AND METHODIST DENOMINATIONS IN THE
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

by
Ericka J. Patillo

A Master's paper submitted to the faculty
of the School of Information and Library Science
of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Master of Science in
Library Science.

Chapel Hill, North Carolina

June, 1999

Approved by:

Advisor

CONTENTS

Introduction	4
History	5
A Baptists, Episcopalians and Methodists in the United States of America	5
B The Hymn in America.....	8
Literature Review	11
Methodology	14
Findings	17
Discussion	20
Glossary	25
Bibliography	27
Appendix A	29
list of hymnals examined, with their printing dates	29
Appendix B	32
Tables	32

Introduction

This investigation began as a mission to determine if there were any differences among the hymnbooks of the Baptist, Methodist and Episcopal denominations in the United States of America. As a musician who has performed at various churches over the years, the researcher had observed that several different denominations had many of the same hymns in their hymnbooks. The extensive hymnal collections at the University of North Carolina and Duke University presented the opportunity to explore these official denominational hymnals. A rudimentary examination of several hymnals revealed variations in the indexing in terms of number and type.

Although these three denominations trace their origins back to the Anglican Church and their hymnals have historically included many of the same hymns, a review of several of the back of the book indexes suggest a number of differences. This preliminary examination suggested three questions:

- Why are these indexes different if the basic content of the hymnals is the same or similar?
- What denominational or chronological differences exist?
- Did hymnal indexes change once the tunes began to be printed with the text?

The period of American hymnody under observation in this study begins in the late

1700s with John Wesley. Although Wesley was not an American citizen, he is credited with being the author of the first hymnal published in the United States. The historical survey ends with the most recent denominational hymnal published in the United States, the *A.M.E. Zion hymnal: official hymnal of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, 1996.

History

A Baptists, Episcopalians and Methodists in the United States of America

These brief church histories serve as an introduction to the denominations, acknowledging their common lineage, illustrating their predominance in America and thus revealing the reason for their inclusion in this analysis.

Many European peoples came to America seeking religious liberty. Most European countries had politically established national religions, and those who wanted to practice other religions were persecuted because of their beliefs. The Mennonites, Methodists, Lutherans, Episcopalians and other denominations traveled to the United States, and after the American Revolution, began to develop distinctly American versions of their groups.

The Protestant Episcopal Church in the U. S. A. has its roots in the Church of England. The first Anglican church in America was established in Jamestown, Virginia in 1607 (Reid, 1990). As this denomination was the politically established religion in England, the American group answered to the state of England as well until the American Revolution. After the United States gained its independence, the Episcopal church reorganized as a separate and distinct American entity, severing its ties to the government

while retaining its episcopal form of governance; that is, it is governed by bishops, each of which controls a diocese which consists of clergy and lay members.

The nineteenth century was a time of expansion for the Protestant Episcopal Church. The Church sent missionaries to the South, the Southwest and the Midwest, and by 1860 there were 150,000 Episcopalians in the United States. This number swelled to 720,000 by 1900. The Church sponsored schools in addition to General Theological Seminary of New York and the Theological Seminary of Virginia, established in 1819 and 1824 respectively (Reid, 1990).

Baptist Churches in the United States of America have their origins in the Puritan movement away from the Church of England. Baptists desired to limit church membership to those who professed to be saints, and advocated the separation of church and state (Reid).

Baptist members of the Christian community in America have never had one central governing body. While those Christians of the Baptist persuasion follow the same doctrine, this group believes that the local church should retain its autonomy and therefore does not report to a governing board yet still belongs to the denomination. There are avenues for communal fellowship, namely conventions. Churches that are members of a certain convention (i.e. Southern Baptist Convention) have common moralistic and/or political beliefs; these beliefs may be variants or in some cases contradictions to the values that another convention holds. However, their doctrinal beliefs are in harmony with other Baptists. Three of the largest conventions are the Southern Baptist Convention (14 million), the NBCUSA (6 million), and the NBCA (3.5 million) (Reid).

This independence among the individual Baptist churches allowed the development of the earliest black churches to take place. By 1895 the National Baptist Convention, U. S. A., Inc. (NBCUSA) was founded in Atlanta, Georgia (Payne, 1991). In 1915 there was a schism, resulting in the National Baptist Convention of America, Inc. (Payne). Other Baptist groups are Primitive Baptists, Missionary Baptists, etc.

Methodism was also an eighteenth century movement away from the Anglican Church, led by the brothers Charles and John Wesley. The first Methodist church in America was established by 1784 in Baltimore, Maryland as a Methodist Episcopal Church. "By 1840 the Methodists had become the largest denomination in America" (Reid, p. 733) largely due to the evangelism of the "circuit riders." By 1906 membership had climbed to 5.7 million. The United Methodist Church is the largest Methodist group in the United States today, with 9,000,000 members. The schisms of the mid-1800s in this church and their subsequent reconciliations are well-documented (Reid).

The African Methodist Episcopal Church was established in 1787 when Richard Allen and other members of the St. George's Methodist Church in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania left that congregation because of discriminatory practices against black members (Payne, 1991). In a similar manner the African Methodist Episcopal Zion church was founded when the black members of the John Street Methodist Episcopal Church in New York City left in 1796 to form their own congregation (Payne).

According to Payne, by 1991 the African Methodist Episcopal Church had 3,500,000 members¹ and the African Methodist Episcopal Zion church had acquired 1,200,000.

¹Reid places this number around 2,210,000 American members in 1981 (p. 30)

Additionally, the Christian Methodist Episcopal Church, established in 1870 as the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church, emanating from the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, had approximately 1,000,000 members worldwide as of 1991 (Payne).²

What these denominations have in common is clear. They are all Christian denominations, with roots emanating from the Church of England. They were all duly Americanized, separated from the control of the state, and experienced tremendous growth in the nineteenth century. These three religious groups were active in missionary activity all over the United States. Despite the great racial divide that pervades this country's history, accommodations for worship were made by these denominations for Americans of all colors. While some of the groups within the denominations developed separately, they did and still do maintain doctrinal commonalities, including the use of some of the same hymns in their worship services.

The next objective is to explore the development of the denominational hymnal in America.

B The Hymn in America

The *Whole Booke of Psalmes Faithfully Translated into English Metre*, commonly known as the *Bay Psalm Book*, was the first book printed in North America in the English

²Reid estimates 800,000 American members. (p. 733)

colonies (1640) (and did not include music until the ninth edition, 1698), and the oldest official American hymnbook is the American edition of *Ausband, Das ist: Etliche schone Christliche Lieder*, published in Germantown in 1742 and used by the Amish in Pennsylvania as late as 1963 (Reynolds). But the first attributable American hymns were written by John Wesley in 1737 (Foote, 1968). However, these were translations of German hymns and therefore cannot be considered original American works. Until the late 1700s, the English tradition was carried on in the United States, with Isaac Watts' *Psalms and Hymns* finding the largest audience. With the Reformation of the 16th century, Protestant hymnody originated songs in the vernacular for public worship. These types of hymns were used by Martin Luther as an effective way to spread doctrine. One of Luther's innovations is that he did not limit himself to metrical settings of the psalms (psalmody), but he felt free to paraphrase scripture and also used sources outside of scripture (Foote).

Beginning in the late eighteenth century and throughout the nineteenth century, American denominational groups begin to publish hymnals for the specific use of their congregations as a means to facilitate a common worship experience but also to reinforce doctrine and solidify their respective liturgies. Many of these hymnals gave the order of the service and other liturgical information, the creed of the denomination, and responsive scriptural readings. Many of the early hymnals did not contain musical scores for the tunes, but gave the names of the well-known tunes to which each hymn could be sung. According to Reynolds, the first official Presbyterian denominational hymnal appeared in 1831 (although it was not published as a separate entity); the Protestant Episcopal Church

began in 1784 and used an American edition of the *Book of Common Prayer* that had hymns bound at the end³; the Episcopal General Convention of 1826 approved *Hymns of the Protestant Episcopal Church, in the United States of America* published in 1827, compiled by Muhlenberg and Onderdonck. It contained 212 hymns and was commonly called the *Prayer Book Collection* and was bound with the *Book of Common Prayer* (Foote; Reynolds). Both Foote and Reynolds assert that the first hymnal authorized for use by the American Methodist church was based on the collections of John Wesley, they disagree on the edition. Although it contained no American hymns, Reynolds credits the 1832 fifth edition of *A collection of hymns for the use of the Methodist Episcopal Church, principally from the collection of the Rev. John Wesley* as the first authorized Methodist hymnal, Foote cites the 1836 edition.⁴

The African Methodist Episcopal Church gives 1818 as the year of its first official hymnal (AMEC, 1984), excluding *A collection of spiritual songs and hymns, selected from various authors*, 1801, compiled by their founding bishop, Richard Allen. That 1818 hymnal, the *African Methodist pocket hymn book*, was closely modeled after the *Methodist pocket hymn-book* of 1807 (Spencer, 1992), eliminating it from being a truly American hymnal; however, the preface to the AMEC 1984 hymnal says it “was the first book of songs published by the Children of Oppression, and the very first to give

³Foote gives the date as 1790.

⁴Julian’s *Dictionary of hymnology* gives the date as that stated in the item’s preface, which is Manchester, 1830.

expression in their own selected language telling of the Christian hope of the race”
(*AMEC*, ix).

The earliest Baptist hymnal was *The psalmist*, published in 1843 and edited by Samuel F. Smith, author of “My country, ‘tis of thee” (Foote; Reynolds). Prior to this the Baptists favored Winchell's *Watts* (1818) and Rippon's *Watts* (1820).

Literature Review

While there is an absence of literature that specifically addresses hymnal back of book indexes, the work of Hans Wellisch and Donald B. Cleveland and Ana D. Cleveland can be applied to the study of hymnal back of book indexes. In *Indexing from A to Z* (1991), Wellisch supports the employment of multiple indexes such as author, title, and subject as opposed to single indexes, especially in poetry anthologies. Multiple indexes are necessary in order to provide multiple access points to the book's content. Wellisch also gives supporting evidence for the existence of narrative type indexes found in Oxford since the 13th century used to find citations from Scripture. Finally, Wellisch concludes in the entry on keywords that “title words alone seldom if ever express the entire subject matter

The Clevelands, in *Introduction to indexing and abstracting* (1990) give several attributes of book indexes: that the book index is a “self-contained information retrieval system . . . , [that it] rearranges the information in the text, . . . [and that it serves] as a pointer to specific details . . . in the book” (p. 125). The authors also point out the complexities involved in the formation of name and subject entries, and the structure of

form and cross-references. Again, while these indexing sources do not precisely target hymnals, they substantiate the existence of multiple indexes in one book and the attributes of back of book indexes. Hymnal indexes function in the same way.

Research has been conducted that addresses the content of denominational hymnals. Jon Michael Spenser's *Black Hymnody* and Albert Edward Bailey's *The Gospel in Hymns* are two examples. In these volumes the authors indicate that there are several hymns common to many denominations. Spenser makes comparisons between predominately black denominations and their white counterparts, while Bailey makes a broader study of ten denominations. Both conclude, however, that there exists a standard group of hymns common to all denominational hymnbooks studied, and that other hymns are added to this core collection to reflect the musical tastes of the several congregations. While Spenser does compare the hymn titles and the table of contents subject headings used among the Baptist and Methodist hymnals that he studied, he does not explore the back of the book indexes. He does submit that the predominately black Baptist and Methodist denominations of the latter half of the 19th century modeled their hymnals after those of the white congregations from which they had ultimately split.

Foote concurs that “American hymnody in the 20th century . . . has almost lost its denominational characteristics . . . , and the use of hymns in the churches tends towards a common practice” (p. 307).

Despite the lack of research in the area of back of book indexes in hymnals, there have been investigations into the organization of hymnal contents and the influence exerted on English and by extension American hymnals by the Roman Catholic Church and the

liturgical Latin hymns:

...the new interest [in the 1820s] in the re-discovered liturgical Latin hymns strongly influenced all later Anglican hymnals, as did Heber's [*Hymns* (1827)] arrangement of his book to follow the order of the Christian year.

The result in England was the development of the liturgical type of church hymnal, with the great bulk of the hymns arranged for the church year ... followed by a collection of 'General Hymns,' topically arranged, as in the earlier collections of the dissenting churches (Foote, 219-220).

This led to *Hymns ancient and modern*, which was not the official Anglican hymnal, but was widely adopted by Church of England congregations. This in turn influenced the Protestant Episcopal Church, and in 1862 the American edition of *Hymns ancient and modern* was published, followed by the first official separately published Protestant Episcopal hymnbook, *The hymnal*, in 1871.

This Roman Catholic liturgical influences outlines the progression from a hymnal selection and organization according to the tunes, to an arrangement based on the Christian year. Additionally, there appears to be a progression from a pocket-sized hymnal printed with text only to a larger hymnbook that includes scores. According to Foote, the first hymnal to print tunes immediately above the words is Henry Ward Beecher's *Plymouth Collection* in 1855.⁵ After this publication and others like it, "singing passed increasingly from the paid choir to the congregation" (p. 218). This observation

⁵Paul Westermeyer attributes the first hymnal to do this as Henry Ward Beecher's *Plymouth Collection of Hymns and Tunes* ca. 1850s (Reid, 1990).

may have some bearing on the way the hymnals are indexed -- the inclusion of the score, and also making the contents accessible to the laity.⁶

Reynolds asserts that the 1870 initiation of the Registry of Copyrights office at the Library of Congress reduced the number of copyrighted tunes in denominational hymnals due to the refusals of permission or the high fees demanded. Compilers instead used public domain tunes from England (p.103).

The Protestant Episcopal Churches' hymnals should contain more information about the liturgy than the other denominations in this study because of their emphasis on a structured service. The Episcopal church's membership is also considered the most educated; this may show up in the sophistication of their indexing. "...the Episcopal Church included in both its clergy and its laity a high proportion of persons of literary culture" (Foote, 1968, p. 221).

In speaking of Baptist hymnal editor Rev. S.F. Smith, Foote says he had "an intellectual and cultural background less common then among American Baptists than it is today" (p. 225).

The literature suggests that there are denominational differences among the members, and the organization of the contents of the hymnbooks, but empirical research into the indexes is absent in the case of these denominational hymnals.

⁶It should be noted here that this was not due to a technological advancement. The printing of musical scores wit

Methodology

A content analysis procedure was employed to examine the back-of-book indexes of three denomination's hymnals: Baptists, Methodists and Episcopalians in the United States. The appearance or absence of the several types of back-of-book hymnal indexes were observed and quantified to determine if any trends exist in denominational indexes from 1801-1996, and to analyze denominational characteristics in hymnbook indexing.

The Methodist, Episcopal and Baptist denominations were chosen because of their established and integral history in the United States of America, the availability of their historical documents, and the availability of their official hymnals. Although these denominations are governed by separate conventions, organizational affiliations were not considered for this study; therefore National Baptist Convention hymnbooks were chosen as well as Southern Baptist Convention hymnals, and Protestant Episcopal Church hymnbooks were analyzed along with African Methodist Episcopal Church hymnals.

A list of denominational hymnals was compiled in consultation with authoritative sources. These include hymnal publication histories listed in several of the hymnbooks, historical church documents, and dictionaries and encyclopedias of hymnology and Christianity such as the *Dictionary of American Christianity*, *Julian's Dictionary of hymnology*, Jon Michael Spencer's *Black hymnody* [See the bibliography and Appendix A for the complete citations]. This list was compared with the holdings of the University of North Carolina Music Library, the Divinity School Library of Duke University, and

another small, private collection.

The hymnals were chosen for examination based on two criteria: a) the hymnal had to be authorized by one of the three denominations under review (i.e. published by the group's publishing house; or the words "official" or "for the use of" and the denomination's name printed on the title page or in the preface; or the hymnal was widely known and accepted as a denomination's authorized hymnal)⁷; and b) the hymnal had to have been published in the United States, with the exception of three hymnals authorized for use by American Methodists and published in England.⁸

The data gathered for analysis include title, denomination, year of publication, presence of scored music, and presence of preface, and the following indexing attributes:

- | | |
|-------------------------|--------------|
| • title of hymn | • tune title |
| • first line of hymn | • tune meter |
| • first line of stanzas | • author |

⁷This latter condition was accepted only for Baptist hymnals, in strict consultation with historical documents and other practice.

⁸

Primitive Methodist temperance melodist, and the 1st and 2nd editions of *Primitive Methodist hymn book*.

- composer
- scripture references
- topical
- subject

The presence of copyright notices and order of worship and/or ritual was also recorded.

Data gathered was entered into Statistical Program for the Social Sciences (SPSS) and Quattro Pro in order to chart any trends. The independent variables were the denomination and publication years of the hymnals. The dependent variables were the indexes, score and preface, and presence or absence of prefatory and ritual material.

For the purposes of this study, front of the book indexes were counted as back of the book indexes if there were no other back of the book indexes present. This detail was noted as the data was collected.

Findings

Seventy-five hymnals were analyzed. Twenty-two (29.3 %) of these were Baptist, 33 (44.0 %) were Methodist, and 20 (26.7 %) were Episcopal. Every decade from 1801 to the present is represented at least once. Five decades had an above average representation of hymnals: 1840s (six), 1850s (six), 1870s (six), 1910s (ten) and 1980s (seven). [See Appendix B for list of hymnals by year and by denomination.] The hymnbooks contained an average of 3.7 indexes. All but one (Richard Allen's *A collection of hymns and spiritual songs from various authors*, 1801⁹) contained at least one index. The hymnbook that contained the most indexes was *Baptist hymnal for use in the church and home* (1883), with nine. The Baptist hymnbooks averaged 4.1, the Methodist hymnals 3.7, and the Episcopal hymnals 3.3 indexes per hymnbook. Figures 2, 3, and 4 illustrate the number of indexes in each hymnal by denomination.

Fifty-one (68 %) of the hymnals included scores. Fourteen (27.5 %) were Baptist, 22

⁹This is an important observation because the first edition of this hymnal, printed just months prior to this one, does ha

(43.1%) were Methodist, and 15 (29.4%) were Episcopal. None of the hymnals prior to 1858 include scores. This finding is consistent with the assertions of Foote and Reid that the first hymnal to include a score was printed in 1855. However, six hymnbooks published after 1855 were printed without scores. Thirty-two (42 %) of the hymnals that have scores have first line indexes.

Forty-five (60 %) of the hymnals that have scores do not have title indexes. Only one Episcopal hymnal has a title index.

The hymnals that do not have scores also do not have alphabetical tune indexes or metrical tune indexes. The first of both of these types of indexes do not appear until 1858. Additionally, the hymnals that do not contain scores do not have composer indexes. The first composer index does not appear until 1878.

The most common index was the alphabetical indexes of the first lines of the hymns. Fifty-one (68.0 %) of the hymnals have first line indexes. Fourteen (27.5 %) were Baptist, 22 (43.1%) were Methodist, and 15 (29.4%) were Episcopal. The presence of this type of index began to decrease as the combination first line/title index gained popularity, around 1964.

[See Appendix B for totals of the several indexes by denomination.]

Fifty-seven of the hymnals do not have author indexes, and only 13 of the hymnals have composer indexes. This latter observation should be considered alongside the following: According to the literature, the first hymnal to include scores was not published until 1855, and the first hymnal in this survey that includes scores was published in 1858. While the hymn tunes certainly had composers, these were not attributed until 1858, and

only in 13 hymnals up to 1996, the year in which the last hymnal examined was published. Moreover, only seven hymnals have a combined author/composer index, and there were only 18 author indexes. Clearly attribution is not a priority in hymnal indexing. In fact, only eight hymnals give copyright acknowledgments or notices. The data do not support an increasing trend in this area. Although two occurrences of copyright notices appeared within the past decade, the first instance of these notices appeared in an 1883 hymnal, and three instances occurred in the 1940s. This finding in some ways substantiates Foote's assertion that after the Copyright Registry Office opened at the Library of Congress in 1883, many hymnbook compilers sought non-copyright materials for inclusion rather than pay hefty fees or fight refusals of permission.

Overall there were few characteristics unique to each denomination. Methodists are the only denomination to include their rituals in their official hymnbooks. The Protestant Episcopal Church hymnals have no author/composer indexes, no first lines of stanzas indexes, and only one hymnal had a title index. The Baptist hymnals contained 41.7 % (10) of the total of scripture references indexes and 36.7 % (11) of the subject indexes.

Discussion

The Baptist, Methodist and Episcopalian denominational hymnals analyzed in this study were all authorized for use by these denominations in the United States and/or were published by them between 1801 and 1996. The study was done to discover if any trends could be observed in back of the book hymnal indexes and if so to determine if they were significant. As a whole, the quantity of indexes do appear to follow a pattern. The highs

and lows (as illustrated in figures 1, 2, and 3) indicate that each denomination increased and decreased the amount of indexes per hymnal around the same time. However, each denomination favored particular types of indexes over others. For example, Baptist and Methodist hymnals contain all the scripture reference indexes observed, and indexes of first lines of stanzas was completely absent from Episcopal hymnbooks.

The concurrent appearances of scores, metrical indexes and alphabetical tune indexes is an important finding. The tunes for many of the hymns are hundreds of years old and commonly known. Before the scores were printed with the tunes in hymnals (1855), the names of the tunes or abbreviations for their meters were printed beside the hymn. In some cases hymns that used the same tunes were printed in close proximity to one another. The inclusion of scores in hymnals and the progression from arranging hymnbooks according to tunes to organizing hymnals based on the Christian year probably necessitated the introduction of metrical and alphabetical tune indexes to collocate and provide access to hymns everyone knew but could no longer find.

The assumption that the Episcopal hymnbooks, because of the reputed higher intelligence of Episcopalians, would have more and sophisticated indexes proved to be incorrect. Foote's (1968) statements about the superior cultural literacy of Episcopalians and the lack of intellectual backgrounds among Baptist congregations are not substantiated by the quantity of indexes in each denomination's hymnals. While the quality of the indexing is left to another study, the Baptist hymnals were found to have more indexes per hymnbook (4.1), with the Episcopal hymnals coming in last with only 3.3 indexes per book.

Although the data were not plentiful enough to draw conclusions in this area, the author noticed what may be a significant difference in the number of indexes in the hymnals of the historically predominately black congregations (i.e. *AMEC hymnal*, *New National Baptist hymnal*, and others). Those hymnals in this study consistently had fewer indexes than their denominational counterparts. Further inquiry is necessary to confirm these findings and determine the causes.

This research serves as the foundation for further research in the area of hymnals and indexing. It is difficult to demonstrate how it parallels with the history of back of book indexing because of the uniqueness of the material and what appears to be an absence of historical analyses of back of the book indexes over time. While the number of indexes per hymnal in these American denominations fluctuated over the almost 200-year span investigated, the production of separately published indexes and concordances has grown. Is this growth in the publication of these sizable indexes the result of a lack of quality or quantity of the back of the book indexes? The shortage of copyright notices is related to this issue as well. If the several denominational hymnals share over half of their contents and have done for over one hundred years, and the churches have not found it necessary to include acknowledgments in every hymnal possibly due to the paucity of new material, why are the back of the book indexes deemed so inadequate as to require separate volumes. Of course, the quality and quantity of the back of the book indexes may be affected by economies of space and finances. The inclusion of indexes increases the price of printing. But certainly money is not the issue when there are seven or more indexes present in the hymnal; perhaps the question of quality is being addressed in the separately

published indexes and concordances.

There are numerous separately published indexes to denominational hymnals. These indexes are of two types: an index/concordance to one official hymnbook, or an index that gives citations to several hymnbooks. In fact, there is almost a proliferation of concordances and indexes for the most recently published denominational hymnals, and some of those indexes are double the size of the hymnal. Whereas the second type of individually compiled indexes does serve to collocate the hymns published in various denominational and ecumenical hymnbooks, it is important to point out that most of these hymnals share more than half of their contents. *The Harvard dictionary of music* states that “today [1966], each major denomination has its own hymnal, sharing nearly half its hymns and tunes with other denominations and adapting the remainder to its own traditions” (Apel, 1966, p. 399).

Finally, there are implications for cataloging. According to the *Anglo-American Cataloging Rules, Second Edition*, 1998 Revision, and current Library of Congress practice, the method by which to indicate in a bibliographic record that an item has an index is to put “includes index” in the contents notes. This type of cursory cataloging is so inappropriate for this class of monographs that it makes the cardinal principle of describing “the physical form of the item in hand” (AACR2, 1998, p. 8) inconsequential. It appears that the primary difference between hymnals and other monographs, between hymnals and other forms of printed music, and among hymnals of several denominations is the indexes: there are unique types of indexes present (one would not find a metrical tune index in any other type of book) and greater abundance. To state that a hymnbook

contains an index is not giving the user of a catalog enough information with which to determine if the item is worth retrieving. If the hymnal does not contain a title index, it is useless to anyone pursuing a hymn for which they only have the title. To a researcher looking for references to specific tunes “includes index” is ambiguous information. At most institutions, catalogers do not list the contents of an anthology in a bibliographic record. Compounded with that fact, the “includes index” contents note does not give the researcher any indication that the tune sought will be present in the hymnal, nor does it indicate the presence of the appropriate alphabetical or metrical tune index that would give access to the tune. While it would be considered excessive to list 400 or more hymn titles in a bibliographic record, describing the types of indexes included in each hymnbook would not be extravagant and the appropriate access points would be a service to patrons.

Glossary

denomination "an association or fellowship of congregation within a religion that have the same beliefs or creed, engage in similar practices and cooperate with each other to develop and maintain shared enterprises

hymn Lyric poem expressing religious emotion -- or perhaps religious faith and commitment. It is intended usually to be sung by a chorus that may or may not be identified as a congregation of worshipers. Also, sacred lyric of original content for use in worship, as opposed to psalmody [from *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, Macmillan, 1980].
A song of praise to God; any composition in praise of God which is adapted to be chanted or sung; specifically a metrical composition adapted to be sung in a religious service; sometimes distinguished from psalm or anthem, as not being part of the text of the Bible. [from *Oxford English Dictionary*]

hymnal a collection of hymns for use in divine worship; a hymn-book. [earliest usage 1537; *OED*]

hymn-book a book containing a collection of hymns [earliest usage 1779; *OED*]

- index* a table of contents prefixed to a book, a brief list or summary of the matters treated in it,...; an alphabetical list, placed (usually) at the end of a book, of the names, subjects, etc. occurring in it, with indication of the places in which they occur. [from the *Oxford English Dictionary*]
- meter* A metrical index of tunes lists the tunes according to the number of lines per stanza and the number of syllables in each given line. Three standard meters are common meter (C.M.), short meter (S.M.) and long meter (L.M.). Other meters are indicated by a series of digits. For example, 7.7.7.7.7.7. indicates that each stanza has six lines, and each line has seven syllables; any tune that has a comparable rhythmic pattern may be used to sing the hymn. [adapted from Reynold's *A survey of Christian hymnody*]

Bibliography

- Anglo-American cataloguing rules*. 2nd ed., 1998 revision. Chicago : American Library Association.
- Apel, Willi (1972). *Harvard Dictionary of Music*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- AMEC hymnal* (1984). Nashville: African Methodist Episcopal Church.
- Bailey, Albert Edward (1950). *The Gospel in hymns: backgrounds and interpretations*. New York: Macmillan.
- Baptist hymnal* (1975). Nashville: Convention Press.
- Cleveland, Donald B. and Ana D. (1990). *Introduction to indexing and abstracting*. 2nd edition. Englewood, Colorado: Libraries Unlimited.
- Foote, Henry Wilder (1968). *Three centuries of American hymnody*. Archon Books.
- Payne, Wardell J. (1991). *Directory of African American religious bodies: a compendium by the Howard University School of Divinity*. Washington, D. C.: Howard University Press.
- Reid, Daniel G. et al. (1990). *Dictionary of Christianity in America*. Downers Grove, Illinois: Intervarsity Press.

Reynolds, William Jensen (1963). *A survey of Christian hymnody*. New York: Holt,

Rinehart and Winston.

Rogal, Samuel J. (1991). *A general introduction to hymnody and congregational song*.

Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow.

Spencer, Jon Michael (1992). *Black hymnody: a hymnological history of the African-*

American church. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.

Wellisch, Hans (1991). *Indexing from A to Z*. New York: H. W. Wilson.

Appendix A -- list of hymnals examined, with their printing dates

Baptist

- 1809 *Dr. Watt's imitation of the Psalms of David, suited to the Christian worship in the*
- 1818 *Psalms carefully suited to the Christian worship, in the United States of America: Being an improvement of the old version of the Psalms of David.*
- 1829 *An arrangement of the psalms, hymns and spiritual songs of the Rev. Isaac Watts, D. D.*
- 1831 *Psalms carefully suited to the Christian worship in the United States of America.*
- 1832 *An arrangement of the psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs of the Rev. Isaac Watts, D. D., to which is added, a supplement of more than 300 hymns from the best authors.*
- 1849 *Baptist harp : a new collection of hymns for the closet, the family, social worship and revivals.*
- 1849 *Baptist Harp: a new collection of hymns for the closet, the family, social worship and revivals.*
- 1853 *Psalmody: a collection of hymns for public and social worship.*
- 1864 *Devotional hymn and tune book for social and public worship.*
- 1883 *Baptist hymnal for use in the church and home.*
- 1883 *Duplex hymn and tune book or selections for praise, for all Christians with music in full, on a new plan.*
- 1883 *Baptist hymnal for use in the church and home.*
- 1892 *New laudes domini: a selection of spiritual songs, ancient and modern, for use in Baptist churches.*
- 1918 *Primitive Baptist hymn and tune book.*
- 1924 *Baptist standard hymnal with responsive readings: a new book for all services.*
- 1926 *New Baptist hymnal: containing standard and gospel hymns and responsive readings.*
- 1926 *New Baptist hymnal: containing standard and gospel hymns and responsive readings.*
- 1964 *Free Will Baptist hymn book.*
- 1975 *Baptist hymnal (1975 edition).*
- 1977 *New National Baptist hymnal.*
- 1977 *New national Baptist hymnal.*
- 1985 *Baptist standard hymnal with responsive readings: a new book for all services.*
- 1991 *Baptist hymnal.*

Episcopal

- 1947 *Hymnal of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America.*
- 1948 *Hymnal of the Protestant Episcopal Church.*
- 1881 *Hymnal: according to the use of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America.*

- 1877 *Hymnal: according to the use of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America.*
- 1874 *Hymns ancient and modern with appendix for the use in the services of the church.*
- 1872 *Hymnal: according to the use of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America.*
- 1859 *Tune-book proposed for the use of congregations of the Protestant Episcopal Church.*
- 1892 *Hymnal revised and enlarged as adopted by the general convention of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America in the year of our Lord 1892.*
- 1981 *Lift every voice and sing: a collection of Afro-American spirituals and other songs.*
- 1940 *Hymnal of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America.*
- 1985 *Hymnal 1982: according to the use of the Episcopal Church.*
- 1940 *Hymnal of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America.*
- 1916 *Hymnal, as authorized and approved for use by the general convention of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America in the year of our Lord 1916 together with the canticles at morning and evening prayer and occasional anthems.*
- 1873 *Canticles of the Protestant Episcopal Church with music.*
- 1933 *Hymnal as authorized and approved for use by the general convention of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States of America in the year of our Lord MCMXVI together with the canticles at morning and evening prayer and occasional anthems.*
- 1875 *Tunes, old and new: adapted to the hymnal as set forth by the General Convention of 1871, and revised and enlarged by that of 1874. With the service book, containing music adapted to all the offices of the book of common prayer.*

Methodist

- 1848 *Collection of hymns, for the use of the Methodist Episcopal Church, principally from the collection of the Rev. John Wesley, A. M.*
- 1900 *Hymn studies: an illustrated and annotated edition of the hymnal of the Methodist Episcopal Church.*
- 1889 *Hymnal of the Methodist Episcopal Church.*
- 1911 *Methodist Sunday School hymnal.*
- 1923 *Methodist hymnal: official hymnal of the Methodist Episcopal Church and the Methodist Episcopal Church, South.*
- 1905 *Hymn and tune book of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South.*
- 1899 *Hymn and tune book of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South.*
- 1891 *Primitive Methodist temperance melodist.*
- 1853 *Primitive Methodist ?.*
- 1854 *Primitive Methodist hymn book.*

- 1885 *Primitive Methodist hymn book.*
- 1850 *Hymns for the use of the Methodist Episcopal Church.*
- 1878 *Hymnal of the Methodist Episcopal Church with tunes.*
- 1894 *Church hymnal revised and enlarged.*
- 1987 *Hymnal of the Christian Methodist Episcopal Church.*
- 1986 *AMEC hymnal.*
- 1912 *African Methodist Episcopal hymn and tune book: adapted to the doctrines and usages of the church. 5th edition.*
- 1966 *Methodist hymnal: official hymnal of the Methodist Church.*
- 1904 *Methodist hymn-book.*
- 1904 *Methodist hymn-book for use in the churches of the Methodist New Connexion (founded 1797).*
- 1858 *Wesleyan sacred harp: a collection of choice tunes and hymns for prayer class, and camp meetings, choirs, and congregational singing.*
- 1849 *Hymns for the use of the Methodist Episcopal Church. Revised edition.*
- 1996 *A.M.E. Zion hymnal: official hymnal of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church.*
- 1849 *Hymns for the use of the Methodist Episcopal Church. Revised edition.*
- 1939 *Methodist Hymnal: official offering of the Methodist Church.*
- 1993 *Lift every voice and sing II: an African American hymnal.*
- 1989 *United Methodist hymnal: book of United Methodist worship.*
- 1966 *Book of hymns: official hymnal of the united Methodist Church.*
- 1954 *AMEC hymnal with responsive readings: adapted in conformity with the doctrines and usages of the African Methodist Episcopal Church.*
- 1867 *New hymn and tune book: an offering of praise for the Methodist Episcopal Church.*
- 1913 *Plantation melodies and spiritual songs, abridged edition: for evangelistic meetings, schools, and colleges.*
- 1814 *Collection of hymns, for the use of the people called Methodists; in miniature.*
- 1801 *Collection of hymns and spiritual songs from various authors. 2nd edition. Philadelphia: Plowman.*
- 1801 *Collection of spiritual songs and hymns, selected from various authors. Philadelphia: Ormrod.*

Appendix B — Tables

<i>title index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	18/28.1%	27/42.2%	19/29.7%	64
<i>yes</i>	4/36.4%	6/54.5%	1/9.1%	11

<i>line/title index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	13/22.0	28/47.5	18/30.5	59
<i>yes</i>	9/56.3	5/31.3	2/12.5	16

<i>author index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	17/29.8	28/49.1	12/21.1	57
<i>yes</i>	5/27.8	5/27.8	8/44.4	18

<i>tune index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	11/26.2	19/45.2	12/28.6	42
<i>yes</i>	11/33.3	14/42.4	8/24.2	33

<i>meter index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	13/28.9	18/40.0	14/31.1	45
<i>yes</i>	9/30.0	15/50.0	6/20.0	30

<i>topical index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	14/26.4	23/43.4	16/30.2	53
<i>yes</i>	8/36.4	10/45.5	4/13.2	22

<i>stanza index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	20/31.7	23/36.5	20/31.7	63
<i>yes</i>	2/16.7	10/83.3	0/0	12

<i>composer index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	18/29.0	29/46.8	15/24.2	62
<i>yes</i>	4/30.8	4/30.8	5/38.5	13

<i>scripture ref. index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	12/23.5	19/37.3	20/39.2	51
<i>yes</i>	10/41.7	14/58.3	0/0	24

<i>subject index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	11/24.4	22/48.9	12/26.7	45
<i>yes</i>	11/36.7	11/36.7	8/26.7	30

<i>composer/ author index</i>	<i>Baptist</i>	<i>Methodist</i>	<i>Episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
<i>no</i>	20/29.4	28/41.2	20/29.4	68
<i>yes</i>	2/28.6	5/71.4	0/0	7

YEAR * denomination Cross tabulation

		<i>denomination</i>			<i>Total</i>
		<i>baptist</i>	<i>methodist</i>	<i>episcopal</i>	
	1801		2		2
	1809	1			1
	1814		1		1
	1818	1			1
	1829	1			1
	1831	1			1
	1832	1			1
	1848		1	1	2
	1849	2	2		4
	1850		1		1
	1853	1	1		2
	1854		1		1
	1858		1		1
	1859			1	1
	1864	1			1
	1866		1		1
	1867		1		1
	1872			1	1
	1873			1	1
	1874			1	1
	1875			1	1

	1877			<i>1</i>	<i>1</i>
	1878		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
		<i>baptist</i>	<i>methodist</i>	<i>episcopal</i>	<i>Total</i>
	1881			<i>1</i>	<i>1</i>
	1883	<i>2</i>			<i>2</i>
	1885		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1889		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1891		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1892	<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>	<i>2</i>
	1894			<i>1</i>	<i>1</i>
	1899		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1900		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1904		<i>2</i>		<i>2</i>
	1905		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1911		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1912		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1913		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1916			<i>1</i>	<i>1</i>
	1917			<i>1</i>	<i>1</i>
	1918	<i>1</i>			<i>1</i>
	1923		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>
	1924	<i>1</i>			<i>1</i>
	1926	<i>2</i>			<i>2</i>
	1933			<i>1</i>	<i>1</i>
	1939		<i>1</i>		<i>1</i>

	1940			2	2
	1947			1	1
	1948			1	1
	1954		1		1
		baptist	methodist	episcopal	Total
	1964	1			1
	1966		2		2
	1975	1			1
	1979	1			1
	1980	1			1
	1981			1	1
	1985	1		1	2
	1986		1		1
	1987		1		1
	1989		1		1
	1991	1			1
	1993			1	1
	1996		1		1
Total		22	33	20	75

I.